

159th Meeting NYS Board for Historic Preservation Meeting Notes

William Krattinger agenda items/significance overviews

New York State Board for Historic Preservation 25 March 2015

Charles H. Coons Farm, Germantown, Columbia County

The Charles H. Coons Farm is an architecturally and historically significant property in the Germantown area of southwestern Columbia County, New York. The principal figure associated with this farm in the later nineteenth and early twentieth century, Charles H. Coons (1844-1912), acquired the property in the 1860s, immediately prior to his marriage to Margaret A. Tompkins (1847-1914). Coons, a descendant of one of the early Palatine German families that settled this area of the Hudson Valley in the early eighteenth century, was noted in an obituary as “one of Germantown’s leading citizens and one of the most prosperous fruit growers in the town.” It was in the period following the couple’s marriage that the present farm house, a dwelling of Picturesque conception with distinctive Italianate-style design features, was erected to replace an earlier house, and it was also during Coons’s ownership that a new barn was erected to the east of the house. Predating those Coons-era improvements is a New World Dutch Barn that survives within the farmstead— a holdover from an earlier period of development and farming that was incorporated into the later farm—which under Coons’s skillful guidance was among the preeminent fruit farms in this region and by some accounts statewide, producing at one point 2,000 barrels of fruit and upwards of 75 tons of grapes annually. Also evident within the existing house are framing and finish features that suggest they were reused from an earlier dwelling that the later house presumably replaced in the post-Civil War period. The property, consisting of the dwelling, two barns, a shed, and approximately eight and one-half acres of associated land, is being nominated in association with NRHP criteria B and C, in the areas of agriculture and architecture, at the local significance level. Criterion B is being cited given Charles H. Coon’s local stature and preeminent position as a major Germantown fruit grower in the latter nineteenth and early twentieth century period, during which time he gave his farm the name “Prospect Fruit Farm”; Criterion C has been invoked given the survival of the farm’s principal architectural components, namely the Picturesque house, New World Dutch barn, and the later barn, all of which are significant examples of their respective typologies.

Christian Hess House & Shoemaker’s Shop, Schoharie, Schoharie County

The Christian Hess House and the associated shoemaker’s shop are architecturally and historically significant resources located on the outskirts of the Village of Schoharie in Schoharie County, New York. The nominated house is presumed to have been built in the period immediately following the American Revolution, given the widespread destruction of the Schoharie Valley during the war, the result of raids conducted by Loyalists and Native Americans acting on behalf of the English Crown. It exhibits features expressive of Palatine German domestic architecture in New York State and the overarching New World Dutch tradition of which its construction is representative. The dwelling’s first definitive resident, Christian Hess (1778-1835), was of Palatine German descent and a shoemaker and leather manufacturer by trade. Hess died while returning from a leather-procuring trip to Matanzas, Cuba; his son Albinis (b. 1806) carried on his father’s trade subsequently, and it appears Zambert Cromer may have carried on the shoemaker’s craft in the nominated shop during the 1870s, by which time Albinis had turned his attention to farming. Given that the shop appears to date to ca. 1805, it appears that it is that in which both Christian and Albinis Hess, and later possibly Zambert Cromer, worked there. The ca. 1783 dwelling, to which a modern off-set addition (1977) has been added, is a timber-frame building built in characteristic New World Dutch fashion with a series of closely spaced H-bents that define its story-and-a-half form. A lean-to extension, located on the rear elevation, represents an early historic-era

modification—and possibly the enclosure of what was originally an open feature providing a covered passage between the principal level and basement kitchen. The shoemaker’s shop, like the house, was also constructed in the New World Dutch manner. While its precise origin is unclear, the house may have been built for a member of the Weaver family before being acquired by Christian Hess around the time of the latter’s marriage. The original floor plan included an accessible-at-grade basement kitchen/keeping room on the southwest roadside elevation, with an adjacent storage room behind; two rooms at first-story level, not inclusive of the lean-to, one heated by fireplace and the other presumably by a stove at one time; and space in the unheated half-story. Certain aspects of the house, namely the two-room first-floor configuration and central chimney, relate it to eighteenth century Palatine German house design in New York and illustrate the continued pervasiveness of traditional housing forms in this region in the post-Revolutionary era. Taken together the house and shoemaker’s shop remain important architectural resources that illustrate the reconstruction of the built environment of Schoharie following the destructive years of the Revolution.

Alligerville Historic District, Rochester, Ulster County

The Alligerville Historic District is significant as a hamlet that was created and developed around a lock on the Delaware & Hudson Canal, one of the earliest canals completed in the United States. Built 1825-1828, the canal’s main purpose was to transport anthracite coal from the Wyoming Fields in northeastern Pennsylvania to the Hudson River and thereon to markets and consumers in New York City. The canal functioned until 1899. Alligerville exists within the section of the canal following the course of the Rondout Creek to its confluence with the Hudson River at Kingston. The district meets National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) criteria A and C at a local level of significance; it is a historically significant entity in the Town of Rochester which shares direct and salient associations with the building and functioning of the canal. Portions of the canal have previously received National Historic Landmark (NHL) status and the entire remaining route has been determined eligible for NRHP listing. In Alligerville are the remains of the Peterskill aqueduct, a suspension bridge designed by John A. Roebling, this being among the resources previously designated as an NHL. The plan of the hamlet and the buildings within the historic district embody distinctive characteristics of a small, early canal town that grew and evolved into the late 19th century. It contains examples of model commercial and residential buildings introduced by the canal company and expressing the Greek Revival style popular in the period. These models influenced private development, but following design trends in the greater Hudson Valley region, this modest Classicism was supplanted by the asymmetrical and picturesque architecture of the Romantic Movement, particularly the Gothic and Italianate modes. While most of Alligerville’s commercial properties were lost following the closing of the canal, nearly all the residential buildings identified on mid-19th-century maps have survived largely intact.

Helen Hill Historic District, Saranac Lake, Essex and Franklin counties

The Helen Hill Historic District is a distinctive residential enclave in the Village of Saranac Lake that is locally significant under NRHP Criterion A in the areas of Health/Medicine and Community Planning & Development and additionally under Criterion C as a largely intact and cohesive collection of domestic architecture, the bulk of which dates to the turn-of-the-twentieth century period. This area of the village, which straddles the Essex-Franklin county border, was rapidly developed starting in the waning years of the nineteenth century under the guidance of Frederick A. Isham, a prominent figure in the history of Saranac Lake who is credited with consolidating the land in this area for residential development. Prior to being subdivided, these roughly 20 acres of land, located on a hilltop immediately east of the village core, had been all but undeveloped and were used for the pasturing of sheep. The nominated district shares significant and salient associations with Saranac Lake’s central importance as a treatment center for tuberculosis, as the Helen Hill neighborhood retains a significant concentration of “cure cottages,” the distinctive feature of which are the exterior porches where patients “took the cure.” There is also one building, the former Mary Prescott Reception

Hospital, which was erected specifically as a health facility in this context. Significance is additionally gleaned—given the planned nature of this residential area—within the larger context of Saranac Lake’s growth and physical development, which was in large measure spurred by the village’s importance as a tuberculosis treatment center and the growth of Adirondack regional tourism. Finally, the nominated district is significant in an architectural context for the collection of houses retained therein, including examples of prevailing domestic architectural styles such as the Queen Anne and Colonial Revival modes, in addition to expressions of the Arts & Crafts aesthetic. While most of the building stock represents fairly modest expressions of contemporary architectural design, the district nevertheless contains representative works by two prominent architectural offices, those of William L. Coulter and Scopes & Feustmann—the partnership of William H. Scopes and Maurice Feustmann—which were responsible for the designs of the Judson Newman Smith house and Prescott hospital, respectively. Not surprisingly, it was tuberculosis treatment that brought all three men to Saranac Lake initially. The Helen Hill Historic District remains a highly cohesive neighborhood in Saranac Lake with important and direct associations to the village’s development in the latter nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, and portrays Saranac Lake’s growth from a provincial Adirondack hamlet to a thriving regional center spurred by the health and tourism industries. It is being nominated in association with the “Cure Industry Resources in the Village of Saranac Lake, Essex and Franklin Co., NY” Multiple Property Documentation Form, which established a context for tuberculosis-related resources there.

National Register Presentation text for V. Bartos SRB 25 March 2015 Peebles Island State Park

The first nomination I have to present from the Finger Lakes is a historic district in the city of Elmira in Chemung County.

The Clinton-Columbia Historic District is sponsored by the Near West Side Historic Association in Elmira who several years ago sponsored the nomination of the Near West Side Historic District. The map shows the Clinton-Columbia district circled in red and the listed Near West Side district just below it. Although very close to each other, the districts are not contiguous and the nominated district contains five sets rowhouses—three at the edges and two in the center—something not found in the listed district to the south. The Clinton-Columbia Historic District is being nominated for its collection of 19th and turn-of-the 20th century architecture (Criterion C). Here we see two of the rowhouses and the Lorenzo Webber* House, which sits across from the rowhouse pictured in the upper right.

*District attorney and member of State Legislature, moved to Elmira in 1867 from Schuyler Co—one of 8 principals in the Bloss Coal Mining and Railroad Co of Elmira

(Slide 2) What we're seeing in this slide is the south side of West Clinton Street between College and Davis Streets. The district is also being nominated for community planning & development under criterion A. The area originally began slowly developing as residential housing in the 1850s but the arrival and growth of the railroad industry greatly accelerated its development as the city's needs for housing increased. West Clinton Street contains most of the buildings in the district and it shows a juxtaposition of modest versions of popular period architecture on the south side and higher style buildings on the north side. This extant architecture indicates that the neighborhood was a gathering place for people of various socio-economic standings, which is supported by period census records.

(Slide 3) This is the north side of West Clinton, from College to slightly past Davis Street. One of the residents of this side of the street was architect Joseph Pierce, whose house is shown in the lower left. As stated in the nomination, this side of street has deeper set-backs, large lawns and more mature trees, which give it more of a pleasant, park-like feeling.

(Slide 4) In addition to the sets of rowhouses, other buildings were clearly intended as rental properties, especially on the south side of the West Clinton. The upper left shows one of a handful of large duplex buildings. Overall, the integrity of the nominated district is good and one of the goals of the listing is to encourage property owners to take advantage of the tax credits.

(Slide 5) The district contains 83 contributing residential buildings representing a variety of period architecture, but a majority of the buildings are Queen Anne or its derivations. The large property on the lower left was built around 1890 for Charles Rapelyea, who was a foreman for a lumber company. To date, we have three letters of support for the Clinton-Columbia Historic District, one being from the Elmira local preservation commission (Elmira is a certified local government). (2 letters of objection)

Next, we head north to Rochester in Monroe County for the first two district nominations to be presented for sections of the 19th Ward on the city's southwest side. All the nominations are sponsored by the 19th Ward Association with support from the Landmark Society of WNY and the Preservation League of NYS. The Arvine Heights Historic District consists of one street that was part of the Arvine Park Tract developed by Mrs. Lily Church Arvine in the late 1910s/early 1920s. Of the four streets in this small tract, Arvine Heights has the most integrity with all 37 houses contributing to the small district, many of them with contributing garages. The top image is a view from roughly midway looking east toward Genesee Valley Park. The lower image is an exceptionally fine Colonial Revival house on one of the larger lots, this one at the west end of the district.

(Slide 2) The Rochester papers from this time period (1920s & 1930s) continually reported on the active home building industry and often published decorating ideas and/or house plans, like the one seen in the upper left. Mrs. Arvine left the choice of house style to those who purchased the lots on Arvine, but you can certainly see the influence the newspaper had on the choice of house style with several of the residences seen here being similar to the "English Type" home.

(Slide 3) The street contains a number of examples of styles popular in the 1920s and early 1930s, such as the three Colonial Revival homes pictured here and an excellent example of a stucco clad Tudor Revival, seen in the upper right. The district is being nominated under Criterion C for its collection of the extant architecture.

(Slide 4) Also well represented are Craftsman style houses. One of the last houses to be built on Arvine Heights was built in the 1950s, also in the Colonial Revival style and is seen in the lower left. In addition to architecture, the district is being nominated for community planning and development (Criterion A) for its association with the growth and development of the city and the history of the Arvine Park tract.

West of Arvine Heights is the Inglewood-Thurston Historic District, also being nominated under Criterion A and C for community planning and architecture. The district was part of the early twentieth century real estate and housing boom experienced by the city and was part of the Boulevard Heights subdivision developed by the Garfield Real Estate Company of Rochester. Like Arvine Heights, this nominated district was identified as retaining integrity to its period of development. Properties on surrounding streets have high incidences of recent infill and remodeling/renovations of existing homes, but Inglewood and a small portion of Thurston have escaped the trend, with residing and replacement windows being the only incursions.

(Slide 2) The district has a collection of architecture popular to its period of significance (1921-1927), with a large proportion being Colonial Revival buildings. Again, this was a period when house style and decorating tips were widely published in the local paper, which appears to also have made an impact with this period of development of the 19th Ward.

(Slide 3) The district contains 141 contributing resources, 77 of them being primary buildings, mostly residences. Among these residences are several fine examples of craftsman, Tudor Revival and American Foursquare designs.

(Slide 4) Here's another view of Inglewood showing more of the architecture and the variations within the styles. As with Arvine, it was the lots that were sold, but the Boulevard Heights developers featured model homes at the ends of the streets at Thurston Road.

(Slide 5) Speaking of Thurston Road, here we have a slide showing the upper (that is, the north) end of the nominated district in the lower level. Thurston is a main roadway through the area and the portion in the nominated district is mostly residential, as opposed to the rest of Thurston which is highly commercial. The lower image shows the former Lutheran Church property with its modest Collegiate Gothic house of worship. The lower images are two houses on Thurston, and the upper right shows the

Colonial Revival Presbyterian Home, which marks the south end of the district on the east side of Thurston.

And now for something completely different: the Liverpool Cemetery in the village of Liverpool in Onondaga County. For those not familiar with Liverpool, it's an incorporated village northwest of Syracuse that narrowly escaped being annexed to the city in the early twentieth century.

Due to its age and status as a still-active burial ground, the cemetery is similar to other cemeteries established in the nineteenth century that reflect the trends in interment practices, in this case going from the late rural cemetery to lawn park, ending with a touch of the memorial park influence. As stated in the nomination, the six acres for the site were originally set aside in the early nineteenth century when the village was first surveyed, but the cemetery wasn't established until ca. 1846.

(Slide 2) The cemetery is on land that has a flat portion on top of a hill that slopes to the east where it is flat. This hill top portion was the first to be developed with a section for burials reinterred from the older burial ground and with the layouts of plots and surviving landscaping reflecting the late rural cemetery design idiom. This section of the cemetery also includes burials of influential families and individuals in Liverpool's history, such as the Gleasons (lower right). The patriarch of the family was Ara Gleason, one of the village's early settlers, whose son Lucius went on to be a prominent lawyer and wealthy banker.

(Slide 3) The cemetery is significant under Criterion Consideration D for its age and association with the Liverpool's history. It's also significant under Criterion A in social history, especially in terms of immigration. As the cemetery slopes east, quite visible is a mixture of German names interspersed throughout which become more prominent further down the hill. The nomination text goes into the history of the German immigrants who settled in the village to first work in canal related industries and

later helped established Liverpool's prominence in the willow basket trade. This sloping section of the cemetery also shows the transition to the lawn park design in cemeteries with the regular plot lines and limited landscaping allowing for monuments to be more visible.

(Slide 4) The last trend in funerary practices is seen in one area of the cemetery—the memorial park philosophy of flat, almost invisible single markers and large, lawn spaces. This tends to be the immediate area around the Civil War Veterans memorial marker from the 1920s, seen in the left.

(Slide 5) Finally, I felt obligated to show images of the only mausoleum on the grounds, built for another of Liverpool's wealthy citizens, James O'Neill (died in 1907) who made his fortune in mining in the Midwest. His parents are buried along the upper end of the slope in the west end of the cemetery, pictured in the upper right.

Waccabuc Historic District

Mead Street, Lewisboro, Westchester County

[Map] The Waccabuc Historic District is significant under Criterion A in the areas of agriculture community planning and development, and entertainment and recreation. The small agricultural hamlet of Waccabuc and much of the surrounding land was owned and developed almost exclusively by the Mead Family. The district, which encompasses 524 acres, includes the historic core of the Mead Family's landholdings; over a quarter of the land within the district is protected within land preserves. The District is also significant under Criterion C due to the wide variety of architectural styles exhibited throughout the community. Excellent examples of Colonial, Federal, Greek Revival, Italianate, Queen Anne, Colonial Revival, Arts and Crafts influenced, Tudor Revival, and even Ranch Style buildings (in addition to a number of vernacular houses and some worker's housing) are all present. Many were built by members of the Mead family and reflect the evolution of architectural styles over nearly two centuries of ownership.

[Elmdon (1780+); 20 Mead (1809+); Meeko (1831+); Homestead (1820/30)]

After Enoch Mead established a tavern and farm along the Post Road during the late eighteenth century, other members of the family began to settle nearby. Later generations established successful agricultural operations or inns in the region, while others made their fortunes in law or real estate.

Martin and Erastus Mead built the hamlet's first large inn, the Waccabuc House, to cater to the growing tourist market after the railroad was completed to nearby Croton Falls.

[Barn, 9 Post Office (1870); Croft Farm (1870); Workmans Cottage (1915) and barns (1890); Croft Barns (1870)]

George Washington Mead left his father's farm in Waccabuc to become a successful lawyer in New York City. He returned by 1870, built a large gentleman's farm, and instilled a love of the family's land in his children. By the early twentieth century, George's children began to focus on how to profit from the family land, without changing its character. Some continued the family's farming operations, which focused on dairying, livestock, and poultry.

[Waccabuc Country Club (1878+); Golf Courses (1912, 1923); Boathouse (ca. 1890)] In 1912, they renovated the 1878 farmhouse from the Indian Spring gentleman's farm into the Waccabuc Inn and built a professionally designed golf course. In addition, they established a cottage rental industry within the hamlet and developed family land away from the Waccabuc hamlet on Mead Street.

[24 Mead (1892); Fairacre (1903); Tarry-A-Bit (1895); 107 Mead (1860)] George's eleven children were primarily responsible for either renovating existing farmhouses or building new residences along Mead Street around the turn of the twentieth century. Range from more modest to high style examples of residential architecture.

[Post Office (1880)] Waccabuc Post Office (still active!) built in 1880 by Robert Hoe, the owner of the Indian Spring gentleman's farm.

[Mead Memorial Chapel (1905)] When George Washington Mead died in 1899, his widow contracted Hobart Upjohn to design this memorial chapel in his honor. The stone gothic revival chapel is individually listed on NR.

[Model Home for Waccabuc (ca. 1955); 33 Mead (1932); Tredinnock (1917); 21 Chapel (1938)] Facing pressure from sources both within and outside the family, the Mead siblings began exploring development plans for the family land. They commissioned reports, designs, and landscape plans, but they could not agree on who and what should be allowed within their community. They wanted to retain the feel of the place despite all economic pressures, and had strict protocols for new construction.

[Mead Cemetery; southern end of Mead Street; 17 Mead frontage; Old Field Preserve access road] The Mead family restricted land ownership on Mead Street to family members through the mid-twentieth century, developed a zoning plan, and eventually established the Long Pond Preserve. As a result of the family's strict oversight and careful management, particularly in the face of twentieth century development pressures, the landscape and architecture within the hamlet of Waccabuc retains a high level of integrity and continues to illustrate its layered history.

***letter of support from Lewisboro Town Board, Lewisboro Historian**

Two visitors on behalf of the district: Melissa DiVincenzo, member of Waccabuc Landowners Council who has coordinated the effort to list the district, and Maureen Koehl, Lewisboro Town Historian

Skinny House

175 Grand Street, Mamaroneck, Westchester County

[Overview, House] Constructed from 1931-1932 the Skinny House is significant under Criterion A in the areas of Social and Ethnic History and under Criterion B for its association with African-American carpenter and building contractor Nathan Thomas Seely. Nathan Seely built the Skinny House on an extremely narrow lot of donated land after he lost his home to foreclosure and his company to bankruptcy during the early years of the Great Depression.

[Closeup current and historic] During the mid-1910s, Nathan and Lillian Seely moved to the Washingtonville neighborhood of Mamaroneck. The neighborhood, located near the railroad line on the edge of the Village, slowly developed over the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, and was home to a community of first-generation immigrant, predominantly Italian, and African-American families. Westchester County's African-American population grew dramatically as a result of the Great Migration. During the first half of the century, Westchester County had the third highest African-American population in the state.

[Side view] Nathan Seely and his brother Willard founded Seely Brothers Inc., a construction company that aimed to build for African-American clients. Seely hired Italian masons from the Washingtonville neighborhood, as well as African-American laborers for the company's projects. Seely Bros. purchased

lots within the Washingtonville neighborhood and built several homes, including Nathan Seely's own house. The Great Depression devastated Westchester County's economy, and especially its housing industry. After Nathan Seely lost both his house and his company, his neighbor Panfilo Santangelo, an Italian immigrant and stonemason, offered Nathan a twelve-and-a-half-foot strip of land between the Santangelo home and the former Seely home for Seely to build upon.

[Plan] Seely drew up blueprints for the ten-foot-wide Skinny House and built the house entirely from salvaged materials. Although owner-building was not uncommon among immigrant and African-American communities during the early twentieth century, the multi-gabled Skinny House is notable for its efficient and beautiful design, careful engineering, and effective interior plan. Challenged by a narrow lot and minimal financial means, Seely created a house that demonstrated both his ingenuity and the desire to provide, above all else, housing for his family.

***letter of support from Mamaroneck Historical Society**

Murphy Grist Mill

138 Beekman Poughquag Road, Beekman, Dutchess County

[Overview] This proposal for the Murphy Grist Mill came into our office as a result of the efforts of Youth for Restoration, a group of Beekman-area high school students interested in local history. Nomination a result of YFR's research and collaboration with local historians and the Town of Beekman.

[Mill and site] The Murphy Grist mill, built in 1889, is significant under Criterion A for its association with social history and commerce in Poughquag and Beekmanville. Built by Theodore Mowatt on the site of an eighteenth century mill, the nominated water-powered mill represents nearly two hundred years of continuous use at this site.

[Mill and stream] William A. Murphy, the mill's only owner-operator, purchased the business in 1898. He improved the mill and added services, including a sawmill. In addition to running the mill, Murphy was active in local government and politics and served terms as town clerk and justice of the peace. After 1910, the mill became part of Lime Ridge Farm, a gentleman sock farm owned by Henry Healy. Although he was no longer its owner, Murphy continued to operate the mill for both and community and Lime Ridge farm through the early 1930s.

[Former Dam] Harold Fortington, a British gentleman farmer, maintained the mill for infrequent use and added a gasoline engine to power the mill early in his ownership. The mill fell into disuse by 1940, but has remained a community landmark. Although the outbuildings affiliated with the mill and much of its machinery are no longer extant, the mill's historic function and relationship to the landscape can still be clearly understood.

[Interior]

[Basement]

[Attic]

William Barkin House

84 East Olive Street, Long Beach, Nassau County

[Overall] The William Barkin House, built in 1947, is locally significant under Criterion C as a rare example of International style architecture in Long Beach. Originally conceived as a summer resort city, Long Beach had begun transforming into a year-round suburban community by 1930. To take advantage of the nascent construction boom in Long Beach after the war, William Barkin purchased the land for the house in 1946.

[Closeup / Rooftop patio view] Designed by architect S. Walter Katz, the house pays homage to the International style Glendon Allvine house, which had been built on Long Beach in 1929. The Barkin House's rectangular massing and setbacks, white stucco exterior, sun porches with tubular metal railing, and playful nautical touches blend the modern style with a casual beach house aesthetic. Barkin had worked as a builder for William H. Reynolds, Long Beach's primary developer, and understood the former mayor's vision. The single-family, architect-designed Barkin House reflects the city's waning tradition of architectural eclecticism and resort-centered architecture at a time of rapid population growth and new construction in the city.

[Entry, Dining Room] *aluminum, grooved wainscoting*

[Living Room, Bathroom]

Canajoharie Historic District

Survey and draft for the district completed by Jessie Ravage and sponsored by a Preservation League Grant

[Overview] The Canajoharie Historic District is significant under Criteria A and C in the areas of community development, transportation, industry, and architecture. The Village of Canajoharie originated in a small trading settlement in the latter part of the eighteenth century on the west bank of the Canajoharie Creek where it flows into the Mohawk River. After the first Erie Canal opened fully in 1825, the community grew rapidly. The village's transportation opportunities improved through its connection to the West Shore Railroad in 1882, New York Barge Canal in 1918, and New York State Thruway in the 1950s.

[Commercial] These transportation routes encouraged commercial and industrial entrepreneurship in Mohawk Valley villages like Canajoharie, where shops, stores, and warehouses lined the streets on the flats adjacent to the river, canal, and creek. *A few images of Canajoharie's commercial core, located on the northern side of the district near the original Erie Canal route and Mohawk River.*

[Industrial] Until the turn of the century, the majority of Canajoharie's industries were located along the Canajoharie Creek, especially Arkell and Smith's flour sack factory, opened in 1859. James Arkell revolutionized the packaging of bulk foodstuffs with his development of first cotton and then paper sacks to replace barrels. The Imperial Packaging Company, later renamed Beech-Nut Foods, began operations in 1892. Beech-Nut foods played a profound role in the ways in which food was processed and marketed in the United States from the late 1800s into the Post World War II era.

[Religious] A few examples of religious architecture in the district, and Prospect Hill cemetery, founded in the mid-19th century.

[Residential x4] The rapid expansion of Beech-Nut and the construction of the Barge Canal in the early twentieth century drew more people to Canajoharie. Rising demand for housing led to the opening of new streets and the construction of new houses to accommodate the growing workforce. Neighborhood development of Queen Anne, bungalow, and four-square homes radiated south, east, and west from earlier established neighborhoods of Greek Revival and Italianate homes.

Williamsbridge Oval Park - Bronx

Located in the Bronx, the Williamsbridge Oval Park, once a forty-one foot deep reservoir, is now a 19 acre public park engineered and constructed in 1937 under the Works Progress Administration (WPA). The Park is significant under criterion A in the area Community Planning and Development as an example of a WPA-funded project that was part of the rapid expansion of the New York City parks system under the leadership of parks commissioner Robert Moses.

[SLIDE]

The focal point for the Park is this art modern style recreation center, which was designed by chief architect Aymar Embury. The architect played a significant role in reshaping New York City parks as either the chief or consulting architect on numerous park projects. It is estimated that he may have completed as many as six hundred projects, including the Central Park Zoo, Prospect Park Zoo, and the New York City building at the 1939 New York World's Fair.

[SLIDE]

The site is also significant under criterion C in the area of Landscape Architecture for its intact Beaux Arts inspired landscape – a radial plan that is credited to Embury and several civil and landscape engineers. While elements of the reservoir survive in the form of some berms, a granite tunnel and various stone walls, the site is more interpretable as a WPA era city park, thus, the period of significance has been established as the date of the park's 1937 completion.

Manhattan Beach Jewish Center, Brooklyn

Designed by Brooklyn architect Jacob W. Sherman, the Manhattan Beach Jewish Center was constructed between 1952 and 1962. [Synagogue to the left – Community Center to the Right] The building dates from a period when Brooklyn had emerged as one of the world's major Jewish population centers. Combining facilities for both synagogue and general community needs, including classrooms, meeting rooms, ballroom, gymnasium and swimming pool, is the product of the "Jewish Center" movement. The design by Sherman reflects developments in Bauhaus-influenced European synagogues of the 1930s. By the time of the synagogue's construction, modernism had become dominant in American synagogue design.

[SLIDE]

The synagogue's sanctuary is notable for its use of Akousto-lith tile, produced by the Guastavino company, which lines the walls, - and the brightly colored abstract mosaic designs on the proscenium arch and on the window surrounds. Other interiors demonstrate a change from post war neoclassical tastes, to a more mid-century modern style.

[SLIDE]

Unfortunately, in October 2012, the surge from Superstorm Sandy submerged much of Manhattan Beach, and inundated the synagogue and community center, flooding the ground floor with five feet of seawater. Demolition and abatement were largely complete by December 2012, and the congregation was able to open the sanctuary for worship and the community center for school and senior services. However, significant damage still needs to be undertaken. To accomplish their goal of full restoration, the Community Center has been working with Ann Friedman from the New York Landmarks Conservancy's sacred sites program.

First Unitarian Church, Buffalo, Erie County

Sponsor: Unitarian Universalist Church

SLIDE 1:

The First Unitarian Church of Buffalo (currently known as the Unitarian Universalist Church of Buffalo), located in the Elmwood neighborhood of Buffalo, Erie County, New York, is a locally significant example of an English Country Gothic style church building with an interior influenced by the Arts and Crafts aesthetic. The building was completed in 1906 and designed by prominent local architects Edward Austin Kent and William Winthrop Kent. Edward A. Kent was one of Buffalo's leading architects in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries and often collaborated with his brother.

SLIDE 2:

The church is significant under Criterion C in the area of architecture, as a notable example of ecclesiastic architecture, specifically English Country Gothic Revival. The First Unitarian Church is also significant under Criterion A in the area of

social history for its prominent role in the spiritual, political, and social lives of the community, and its association with the liberal movement in the area. The period of significance begins with the construction of the building in 1906 and closes in 1957 after some minor repairs were made following a small fire.

SLIDE 3:

The church building is divided into the sanctuary unit and an attached annex, forming a sort of inverted L plan. The church expresses the English Country Gothic Style in its asymmetrical plan and the steep roof with low, overhanging eaves, as well as the prominent crenelated tower. The annex is similar in style and materials to the main church block. Two additions to the annex occurred over time, expanding its space. The additions consist of a 1925 kitchen and meeting room addition, as well as an entry vestibule added in 2001.

SLIDE 4:

Perhaps the most notable interior feature of the building is the heavy dark wood hammer beam ceiling in the auditorium. The ceiling is finished in wood decking and is supported by wood purlins connected to the hammer beam truss. The truss is supported by limestone corbels. The corbels at the front of the sanctuary are ornamented with lily and pinecone motifs, among others, while the corbels throughout the rest of the sanctuary are simpler limestone blocks.

This is First Unitarian Church of Buffalo. Any questions?

Stevens-Sommerfeldt House, Clarendon, Orleans County

Sponsor:

SLIDE 1:

The Stevens-Sommerfeldt House is locally significant under criterion C as a rare surviving example of a late Federal period stone house located near Clarendon, Orleans County, New York. Constructed of limestone quarried on-site in the late

1820s for John Stevens, an early pioneer settler to the region, the house also represents the early era of settlement and development in rural Orleans County. The interior of the house reflects a center hall plan, with a parlor to either side, typical of the era. Around 1861, when John Stevens's son, Merrick took ownership of the house, it appears that a one-story kitchen wing was added to the north side of the house.

For its associations with the early settlement and development of Clarendon, the property is significant under criterion A. The period of significance begins with the initial construction of the house, ca. late 1820s, and concludes in ca. 1950. This era encompasses all significant architectural changes made to the property by the long-time owners the Stevens and Sommerfeldt families. The Stevens family owned the house for over a century, and the Sommerfeldt family, the current owners, has owned the property since 1923.

SLIDE 2:

The stone Federal style residence was said to have been constructed for John Stevens and his family by a local stonemason known only as "Murphy." The Stevens family, which arrived in Orleans County in 1813, was one of the earliest settlers to the Clarendon area. John Stevens himself played a large role in helping develop and settle the "Honest Hill" area, as this small region became known. Stonemason Murphy is credited with two other nearby limestone residences. Federal style residences were built in the area around this same era, although the Stevens-Sommerfeldt House remains the best and most intact example of this group. The house is notable for its uncommon full-width one-story shed-roof projection along the rear of the building, which appears to have been part of the original construction of the house.

SLIDE 3:

While the house has laid vacant for several years, being used primarily for storage, and is in poor condition, the Stevens-Sommerfeldt House retains a good level of interior integrity. The building contains a historic staircase with its historic newel post and balustrade, many original wood paneled doors, wood moldings and trim, and other features. The owner's son is currently working to stabilize and rehabilitate the house for use as his residence.

This is the Stevens-Sommerfeldt House, are there any questions?

Union and State Streets Historic District, Olean, Cattaraugus County

Sponsor: Jeff Belt, Sol Epoxy

SLIDE 1:

The Union and State Streets Historic District in the City of Olean, Cattaraugus County, New York, is locally significant as an intact enclave of commercial architecture representing the golden age of economic and commercial activity in Olean. The Union and State Streets Historic District is significant under Criterion A in the area of Commerce and under Criterion C in the area of Architecture. The portions of North and South Union, as well as a small portion of West State Street, within the district boundaries served as the primary business district for the region from the mid-nineteenth century into the mid-twentieth century. While areas immediately adjacent to the district reflect alteration, demolition and modern development, the buildings within the historic district retain a high level of integrity to their original design features, and comprise a visually cohesive grouping of commercial buildings constructed and updated between in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

SLIDE 2:

The period of significance for the Union and State Streets Historic District extends from 1866 through 1939. It begins in 1866, when the earliest extant commercial

buildings were constructed on North Union, following a fire that same year which burned the entire west side of the block between State Street to Laurens Street. Masonry reconstruction in the commercial district rapidly expanded through the 1880s, thanks to the wealth accrued by Olean's successful oil industry along the Allegheny River. As the city grew, its buildings became larger, and more ornate, designed to stand out amongst their neighbors; many were designed by well-known architects.

SLIDE 3:

While the last contributing building was constructed in 1915, many of the commercial buildings received notable façade updates in the late 1930s, installing structural glass tiles and new signage, marking the end of the period of significance. The historic district contains several excellent intact storefronts, with wood interior displays, as well as those modernized in the 1930s.

SLIDE 4:

While the district continues to serve as the city's commercial center, Olean's dominance in the region diminished once the oil industry closed and development patterns moved away from downtown. Although an intact collection of original buildings remains within the historic district, many downtown storefronts are now vacant. However, the economic downturn in Olean has worked in the architecture's favor in that little money was spent to renovate the commercial district facades of the early twentieth century, maintaining the district's integrity.

This historic district project has created great interest in the tax credit programs as a tool to help rebuild and revitalize Olean.

This project has received seven letters of support, including those from Mayor William J. Aiello, State Assemblymember Joseph Gillio, State Senator Catharine Young, and several owners.

This is the Union and State Streets Historic District, are there any questions?

LISTED BY OTHER STATES

SLIDE 1:

Lafayette Park, Detroit by Mies van der Rohe. Listed 1996

- Planned beginning in 1946 as Detroit's first Urban Renewal slum clearance project.
- Its 46 acres encompasses three distinct but carefully connected sections: on the western side are 21 multiple-unit townhomes and a high-rise apartment building; down the center runs Lafayette Park, 13 acres of greenery, recreation facilities, and a school; and farther east are twin apartment towers and a shopping center.
- Notable as the largest collection of buildings designed by Mies van der Rohe, but also is one of America's most successful post-World War II urban redevelopment projects.
- When listed in 1996, it was only 40 years old.
- Although Lafayette Park did little to stem the flight of middle and upper-income families to the suburbs (one of the overall goals of urban renewal), it did succeed in creating an ethnically diverse community that continues to thrive today, attracting residents with its combination of good design, diverse housing, and community amenities in a setting that retains high integrity from its period of construction.

SLIDE 2:

Pine Bluff Civic Center, Pine Bluff Arkansas designed by Edward Durrell Stone. Listed 2005

- Criterion Consideration G, less than 50 years of age.
- Edward Durrell Stone's only commission for a civic complex in his native state of Arkansas The complex, which includes three buildings, a communications tower, a podium, three courtyards, a colonnade and landscape designed by Edward Durrell Stone, Jr.
- The Civic Center was built on a formerly swampy area that had been occupied by substandard housing. The construction of the Civic Center represents the pivotal role of urban renewal in modernizing and revitalizing Pine Bluffs downtown in the 1960s.

SLIDE 3:

Town Center Plaza Apartment Towers, Washington, D.C. designed by I.M. Pei. Listed 2014

- Town Center East is a two-building apartment complex built 1960-1961 within the much larger “Town Center Plaza” mixed-use superblock.
- The property is also significant as one of the earliest and most distinguished components of the Southwest Redevelopment Area, one of the most extensive and thorough urban renewal efforts in the nation. The building of Town Center East contributed significantly to the development of both the Southwest quadrant and the District of Columbia.
- The goal of the redevelopment effort was to "eradicate some of the city's worst slums, providing thousands of new homes for low income families, and help eliminate disease and crime." However, a goal the Washington Post listed as even higher on the project's list of priorities was "to stop the 'flight to the suburbs' of many upper and middle-income families by providing good homes at convenient locations."

SLIDE 4:

Capitol Towers, Sacramento, California designed by Wurster, Bernardi, and Emmons, others. State Register Listed, Determined NRE 2014.

- Notable as the residential component and first privately sponsored development in Sacramento's first realized urban redevelopment area, the Capitol Mall Redevelopment Project.

SLIDE 5:

Fiberglas Tower and Levis Square, Toledo Ohio designed by Harrison and Abramovitz, IM Pei and others. NR Listed 2012.

- Criterion Consideration G, less than 50 years of age.
- Is exceptionally significant at the local level in Toledo, Ohio as the centerpiece and most fully realized portion of the highest profile downtown urban renewal project in Toledo
- Although, like many urban renewal projects of the 1950s and 1960s, the project never lived up to its early promise, the construction of the tower, plaza, and garage were viewed as the “focal point” of an urban renewal

project that would change the destiny of Toledo's downtown core, and they were the only elements of that plan that were completed much as they had been planned by architect I. M. Pei in the early 1960s

SLIDE 6:

Tiber Island Cooperative Homes, Washington DC, Keyes, Lethbridge & Condon. NR Listed: 2013

- Criterion Consideration G, less than 50 years of age.
- Tiber Island features modernist brick and concrete edifices carefully arranged in a landscape designed by Eric Paepcke. A total of 368 apartments, distributed among four eight-story towers, form a pinwheel centered on a large open plaza.
- The planning, landscaping, and architecture of Tiber Island speaks to an ideal for urban living through its mixture of high and low rise units, integration of open landscapes and private gardens, and an acceptance of the automobile as a necessity for modern living while keeping it out of sight.
- Its architecture and planning were touted as model for other Urban Renewal projects to follow and the importance of its design was immediately recognized.

LISTED IN NEW YORK

Thus far, New York State has listed few resources identified with Urban Renewal programs. However, as time continues to march forward, more and more resources identified with this era will be coming through our office, either for consultation or as National Register projects.

SLIDE 7:

Hamlin Park HD, Buffalo (listed 2013)

- Notable for the neighborhood's participation in the Model Cities program between 1966-75
- Attempted to revitalize the neighborhood through providing funds for maintenance and repair, which included aluminum siding, metal balustrades and porch supports and other elements.

BUILDINGS DETERMINED ELIGIBLE IN NEW YORK

SLIDE 8:

Washington Square Village

New York City (1950-52)

Paul Lester Wiener & SJ Kelser & Sons (architects)

- Eligible under criterion C as an example of post-war Urban Renewal planning and design.
- Superblock project consisting of two large apartment buildings, each three blocks long, elevated landscape plaza, commercial strip and below-grade parking.
- Corbusian influence in sculptural roof elements that hide mechanical systems as well as pilotis of the base.

SLIDE 9:

Shoreline Apartments, Buffalo (1971-1974) by Paul Rudolph

Determined National Register Eligible

- Eligible under Criterion C as an “exceptionally significant” example of the Brutalist style designed by internationally prominent architect Paul Rudolph
- Also eligible under Criterion A for its associations with the Urban Renewal era in Buffalo.
- Buffalo Waterfront Complex was originally planned to be a multi-phased Urban Renewal project to revitalize Buffalo’s waterfront and Outer Harbor areas.
- Project cleared a large West Side neighborhood consisting of mainly nineteenth century buildings, relocated people of predominantly Italian descent.

SLIDE 10:

Empire State Plaza, Albany (1959 - 1976) by Wallace Harrison et. al.

Determined National Register Eligible

- Designed under the leadership of Wallace K. Harrison, Eligible under Criterion C as an architecturally significant example of the New Formalist architectural movement. Also notable as the state’s largest governmental facility.
- Eligible under Criterion A for its associations with the Urban Renewal history of Albany, which removed 40 city blocks of the City, displacing more than 10 thousand residents.

COMING SOON

Many other buildings and resources are on the radar, and will likely be coming across our desks soon, either as consultation projects or as National Register projects.

SLIDE 11:

Main Place Mall, Buffalo (1965-69) designed by Harrison and Abramovitz.

- One of Buffalo's largest Urban Renewal projects right in the city's downtown.
- Disrupted the City's radial street grid, cutting off traffic, and demolished the previous Erie County Savings Bank building, designed by George B. Post in the 1890s.
- Attempt to bring modern suburban-style shopping to Downtown Buffalo.
- While the tower is occupied, the lower level mall is generally vacant and has been for years.

SLIDE 12:

One Seneca Tower (aka Marine Midland Center), Buffalo (1969-72) Skidmore, Owings and Merrill

- The tallest building in the City of Buffalo
- Consists of a base that straddles Main Street and a tower that reaches 40-stories in height.
- For decades served as the headquarters of Marine Midland and later HSBC bank, now 90% vacant.
- Some want to tear it down; others have started looking at it as a potential tax credit project.

SLIDE 13:

Chatham Towers and Chatham Green, New York City (1961-65)

- A "formally powerful and technically adventuresome" project that attempted to raise the baseline for middle-class living, it is also one of the city's foremost examples of the Brutalist mode.
- The project was among the first exposed concrete residential towers in the city, and arguably the first to emulate Corbusian *beton brut*.

Several resources that are on the radar involve significant downtown governmental complexes, including:

SLIDE 14:

Civic Center Plaza, Rochester (1956-63)

SLIDE 15:

Government Plaza, Binghamton (1972)

EVALUATING UR RESOURCES

Creating a Methodology

Urban Renewal era resources are just recently becoming the source of scholarly research and evaluation. It is perhaps the most challenging chapter of American urban and architectural history to evaluate objectively, as these are the types of projects that rallied the historic preservation cause. It's also an architectural style that some find aesthetically unappealing and that can incite a strong reaction.

However, it is important to look at Urban Renewal era resources objectively. It was not long ago that the Art Deco style was despised, for its use of elaborate patterning and superficial modern style. Mid-century modernism has also faced a new resurgence in popularity.

The following slides begin to create a methodology that can be used when evaluating Urban Renewal resources. This discussion is based on the article "The Difficult Legacy of Urban Renewal" by Richard Longstreth (2006). **As Longstreth notes, "Urban Renewal bestowed upon communities come places of lasting value that can be appreciated if we consider them apart from the baggage they have acquired."**

SLIDE 16:

- Personal taste or emotion should never influence the assessment of work from a historical perspective, especially when looking at resources from the recent past.
- Tastes change; it's our role to remove as best we can our own biases and opinions from the equation.
-

SLIDE 17:

- Understand that there may be two perspectives to Urban Renewal era projects. There will always be a person who cannot forget that which was

demolished. And this era should be part of any sort of nomination. There will also be people who celebrate and appreciate the end result.

- However, as Longstreth noted, “What urban renewal projects replaced must always be remembered, but should not give cause for rejecting the potential value of what came afterwards.”

SLIDE 18:

- Integrity: As is the case with any resources that we evaluate, we must evaluate whether or not the resource retains enough integrity to still speak to its significance.
- Often time, since resources from this era are so individualistic, you need to delve more deeply into understanding the resource.
- Resources from the Urban Renewal era are particularly fragile, as Longstreth notes. Right now there is a strong general bias against many of them, and they seem “dated” rather than “historic.”
- This sentiment can lead to changes and alterations that may undermine the integrity of the resource.

SLIDE 19:

- Examine on a case-by-case basis, with projects examined as individual efforts within a local context, as well as related to the national movement.
- Not just a sort of “one size fits all” type of style, but much more individualistic, tied to the architect and designer’s personal design philosophies or to the specific goals of the project.
- May have to look at a broader history in order to fully understand how the project fit into the municipality, such as the socio-economic climate, local politics, how the project may have changed, etc.

SLIDE 19:

- Relationship to surrounding urban fabric should not necessarily be examined, as it was seldom a concern to planners during project development.
- For example, many urban renewal housing projects often tended to focus inward, without a strong presence from primary streets.

SLIDE 20:

- However, site planning and landscape frequently was part of the development, and should be viewed as part of the resource.
- Often landscape planning played an integral role in the concept of the resource.

SLIDE 21:

- Look at whether this was a single project, or a component of a larger, long-range master plan.

SLIDE 22:

- The bottom line is that when looking at Urban Renewal era resources, it's important to look beyond the ultimate social or economic success or failure or urban renewal era policies or theories and understand the resource on its own terms, within its own design parameters.

END SLIDE:

Urban Renewal has left a complex legacy in American cities. It represents an era when many communities sought new answers for addressing increasing populations, housing shortages, economic decline and other issues. It represents an era of bold, often creative, projects that re-envisioned the urban environment for a modern age.

Many resources listed on the National Register are associated with complicated, and even painful, historical legacies. Listed resources such as former slave cabins, battlefields, and mental hospitals all speak to our complex and multi-faceted American history, serving as physical reminders, teaching lessons of discrimination, loss, and a changing understanding of the world we live in. Urban Renewal era resources carry with them reminders of wide-scale demolition and forced relocations. However, Urban Renewal has left us with more than just lessons which we must avoid –without the lessons learned, the historic preservation movement may not have taken root, and we may not have learned to value the history and sense of place in our communities.